**Volume 2, No 3 - Juni 2025** 

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



# MEASURING GOVERNMENT PERFORMANCE THROUGH GOVERNANCE INDICATORS: CASE STUDY OF DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

Ralainirina Razokiny Eric<sup>1\*,</sup> Ralaivao Hanginiaina Emynorane<sup>2</sup>, Jean Tsitaire Arrive<sup>3</sup>, Whega Danitsaike Bien-Aimé<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Institut Supérieur de Technologie d'Ambositra, Madagascar

<sup>2</sup>Universitas Hasanuddin, Indonesia

<sup>3,4</sup>Université de Toliara, Madagascar

<u>eric.ralainirina@yahoo.fr</u>, <u>emymorane@gmail.com</u>, <u>tsitair@yahoo.com</u>, wwwheg@live.fr

Corresponding author email: <a href="mailto:eric.ralainirina@yahoo.fr">eric.ralainirina@yahoo.fr</a>

Received: 13-05- 2025 Revised: 20-05-2025 Approved: 05-05-2025

#### **ABSTRACT**

This study explores key dimensions of governance in developing countries, with a focus on the factors that influence government effectiveness, institutional integrity, and public accountability. Using a qualitative approach methodology, the study uses documentation analysis as its primary method, drawing on secondary data from reputable sources such as World Bank reports, government documents, and publications by international organizations. The findings highlight persistent challenges faced by developing nations, including weak institutions, limited civic participation, inefficient service delivery, inconsistent regulatory practices, and systemic corruption. Despite numerous reform efforts, progress has often been hindered by lack of political will, inadequate resources, and entrenched power structures. However, the study also identifies examples of best practices and emerging innovations such as digital governance tools and community-based accountability mechanisms that offer potential pathways for improvement. By analyzing these governance dimensions, the study provides a nuanced understanding of the structural and contextual factors that influence governance effectiveness in developing contexts, offering insights for policymakers, development partners, and scholars seeking to promote more inclusive and accountable governance systems.

Keywords: Governance, Effectiveness, Developing Countries, Corruption, Political Stability

#### **INTRODUCTION**

Governance is widely recognized as a critical factor in shaping the development outcomes of countries, especially in the context of political stability, economic growth, social equity, and institutional trust (Emynorane & Arrive, 2024). In developing countries, where state institutions often face structural and operational weaknesses, the quality of governance directly influences the effectiveness of policy implementation, the delivery of public services, and the legitimacy of political systems (Kaufmann et al., 2010). For this reason, understanding the dynamics of governance has become essential not only for scholars and policymakers but also for international development partners aiming to promote sustainable development.

Despite decades of reform and investment in institutional capacity building, many developing countries continue to struggle with weak governance structures (Goel et al., 2017). Challenges such as inefficient public administration, lack of transparency, political instability, and systemic corruption remain deeply embedded in public institutions (Esmati et al., 2024). These governance deficits hinder efforts to reduce poverty, improve service delivery, and attract sustainable investments. As global attention increasingly turns toward achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particularly Goal 16 (peace, justice, and strong institutions), there is a renewed

Volume 2, No 3 - Juni 2025

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



urgency to critically examine governance in developing contexts (Rahman et al., 2019).

Much of the existing literature on governance in developing countries tends to focus on isolated issues such as corruption, rule of law, or political participation without providing an integrated view of how these elements interact and influence one another. While quantitative governance indicators from institutions like the World Bank or Transparency International offer valuable benchmarking tools, they often lack the contextual depth necessary to fully understand the nuances of governance practices across different countries and regions (Mutarindwa et al., 2020). There is a need for qualitative, evidence-based analysis that examines governance dimensions in a holistic and context-specific manner.

The research problem addressed in this study stems from the limited availability of integrated, qualitative analyzes that contextualize governance indicators in developing countries. While quantitative indices are widely used to assess governance performance, they often overlook the complex socio-political realities that influence institutional outcomes. This creates a gap in understanding the actual mechanisms through which governance impacts public service delivery, trust in government, and development trajectories.

This study seeks to address this gap by employing a qualitative methodology grounded in documentation analysis. By analyzing authoritative sources such as World Bank reports, government documents, and international publications, the study explores the complex reality of governance in developing countries. Rather than treating governance dimensions as isolated variables, it adopts an integrated approach that highlights their interdependence and cumulative impact on public sector performance and citizen trust (Sima et al., 2023). This allows for a more comprehensive understanding of the systemic challenges that affect governance outcomes.

Recent studies have emphasized the importance of multidimensional governance frameworks in capturing the interplay between formal institutions, political culture, and civic engagement (Thamrin et al., 2023). New literature has highlighted the role of adaptive governance strategies, emphasizing resilience, flexibility, and localized solutions in fragile contexts (Apaza, 2009). Moreover, research by Malik (2024) illustrates how digital governance innovations have the potential to overcome institutional inertia and improve responsiveness in public administration. These perspectives support the rationale for a qualitative, context-sensitive approach in analyzing governance indicators beyond just statistical representation.

The novelty of this study lies in its qualitative synthesis of secondary data, offering a critical interpretation of governance dimensions that are typically examined through a quantitative lens. This approach allows the study to move beyond statistical correlations and delve into the underlying institutional, political, and socio-economic conditions that shape governance practices (Rahman et al., 2019). It also brings attention to contextual variations in how history, culture, political systems, and development paths influence governance in unique ways across developing countries (Modipa, 2023).

Moreover, the study highlights emerging governance practices and innovations that have shown promise in addressing longstanding challenges. These include digital governance tools that enhance transparency, community-based monitoring of public services, and participatory budgeting initiatives that strengthen accountability (Long et al., 2021). By identifying such practices, the study contributes to the growing body of knowledge on practical and adaptable governance solutions that can be replicated or

Volume 2, No 3 - Juni 2025

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



scaled in similar contexts (Klein et al., 2023).

This study is also timely, giving increasing global attention on governance resilience in the wake of recent crises, including the COVID-19 pandemic, which exposed institutional vulnerabilities across many developing nations (Lutterbeck, 2013). As governments face growing demands from citizens for more responsive, inclusive, and transparent governance, there is a pressing need for analytical work that supports informed policymaking and evidence-based reform strategies (Mansourian et al., 2016).

#### **RESEARCH METHODS**

For this study, a qualitative approach was used, focusing primarily on documentation analysis to explore the key dimensions of governance in developing countries. The data was drawn from secondary sources, including World Bank reports, government publications, and other reputable international organizations that provided in-depth insights into political stability, public service quality, regulatory frameworks, rule of law, and corruption control. This documentation study enabled a comprehensive analysis of existing governance frameworks, policies, and their outcomes, while identifying trends, challenges, and best practices in developing countries. The qualitative approach allowed for a deeper understanding of the complexities involved in governance and the contextual factors influencing these critical issues.

### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

In developing countries, effective governance hinges on the ability to address key challenges that shape the relationship between the government and its citizens. Among these challenges are voice and accountability, political stability and absence of violence, quality of public services, regulatory quality, rule of law, and control of corruption, each of which plays a crucial role in fostering sustainable development and ensuring the well-being of the population.

### **Voice and Accountability**

In many developing countries, voice and accountability remain central to the pursuit of democratic governance and inclusive development (Goel et al., 2017). These indicators measure the extent to which citizens can participate in political processes, express opinions freely, associate without fear, and access independent media (Francken et al., 2009). While numerous nations have made progress in holding free elections and encouraging civic engagement, genuine participation is often undermined by weak institutions, limited political pluralism, and barriers to free speech (Emynorane & Arrive, 2024). Elections may occur regularly, but the quality of democratic choice is often diluted by voter intimidation, flawed electoral processes, and restrictions on opposition parties.

Freedom of expression and media independence are also major concerns. In several developing nations, state control or heavy-handed regulation of the media limits access to diverse viewpoints (Evensen & Sovacool, 2024). Journalists frequently face censorship, harassment, or violence, particularly when exposing corruption or criticizing those in power. The absence of free press undermines government accountability, as citizens are deprived of accurate information about public affairs (Esmati et al., 2024). In some contexts, social media has emerged as an alternative

Volume 2, No 3 - Juni 2025

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



platform for expression, but it also faces increasing regulation and surveillance by governments seeking to control the narrative.

Strengthening voice and accountability in developing countries requires robust legal protection, active civil society, and international support (Klein et al., 2023). Empowering local communities, promoting civic education, and investing in independent media can create a more participatory political culture. At the same time, donor agencies and multilateral organizations can play a vital role by supporting reforms that promote transparency, electoral integrity, and freedom of expression (Long et al., 2021). Ultimately, enhancing these dimensions of governance is not only about building democracy but also about ensuring that public institutions reflect the will and needs of their citizens.

### Political Stability and Absence of Violence

Political stability remains a significant challenge for many developing countries, often shaped by historical legacies, weak institutions, and deep-rooted socio-economic inequalities (Modipa, 2023). Many of these nations have experienced colonial rule, authoritarian governance, or prolonged internal conflicts, leaving fragile political systems in their wake. Weak rule of law contest state legitimacy, and ethnic or religious divisions can exacerbate tensions, making governments vulnerable to frequent changes, unrest, or military interventions (Rondinelli, 1981; Sima et al, 2023). Political transitions such as elections or leadership changes can trigger instability if not managed transparently and inclusively.

Violence and insecurity are often symptoms of deeper structural issues, including poverty, youth unemployment, marginalization of minority groups, and lack of access to justice (Rahman et al., 2019). In some countries, insurgencies, civil wars, or organized crime networks further erode political instability. For example, regions plagued by terrorism or armed groups such as the Sahel in Africa or parts of South Asia face constant threats to peace and governance. Additionally, election-related violence, political assassinations, and repression of dissent are common in environments where power is heavily centralized or contested.

To promote political stability and reduce violence, developing countries must strengthen institutions, promote inclusive governance, and address socio-economic drivers of conflict (Emynorane et al., 2024). Building trust between citizens and the state is crucial, this requires transparent governance, equitable public service delivery, and fair dispute resolution mechanisms (Arrive et al., 2024). International support can assist through capacity-building, peacebuilding efforts, and conflict prevention initiatives (Smith et al., 2012). Ultimately, sustainable political stability is rooted not just in security responses, but in ensuring that all citizens feel represented and protected within their political systems.

### **Quality of Public Services**

The quality of public services such as education, healthcare, water supply, sanitation, and transportation are a critical determinant of development outcomes in any country (Esmati et al., 2024). In developing nations, however, these services often fall short due to a combination of underfunding, poor infrastructure, and weak administrative capacity (Lutterbeck, 2013). Citizens frequently face long waiting times, inadequate coverage, and inconsistent service delivery. In rural and marginalized urban

Volume 2, No 3 - Juni 2025

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



areas especially, access to even the most basic services can be limited or completely absent, deepening inequality and poverty.

One major factor contributing to low-quality public services is corruption and mismanagement. In many developing countries, public funds intended for schools, hospitals, or social welfare are diverted or poorly spent. This not only undermines the effectiveness of services but also undermines public trust in government institutions (Mansourian et al., 2016). For example, "ghost" teachers on payrolls or medicine stockouts in public clinics are common symptoms of systemic inefficiencies. When citizens lose faith in public institutions, they may turn to private alternatives, which are often unaffordable for the poor, further widening the gap in service quality and access.

Another key issue is the lack of skilled personnel and modern infrastructure. Public servants in developing countries may not receive adequate training or compensation, leading to low motivation and high unemployment (Long et al., 2021). Moreover, the absence of digital systems and reliable infrastructure hampers service delivery and monitoring. Schools without textbooks, clinics without electricity, or government offices without basic equipment are not uncommon (Klein et al., 2023). Without significant investment in both human capital and physical infrastructure, efforts to improve service quality are unlikely to be sustainable.

Improving the quality of public services in developing countries requires a multipronged approach. Reforms should focus on improving transparency, strengthening accountability mechanisms, and adopting digital technologies that enhance service efficiency (Kaufmann et al, 2010). Decentralization can also empower local governments to respond better to community needs. At the same time, partnerships with civil society and the private sector can help fill capacity gaps and promote innovation (Malik, 2024). Ultimately, improving public service quality is essential not only for meeting basic human needs but also for fostering trust in governance and supporting long-term economic development.

### **Regulatory Quality**

Regulatory quality in developing countries plays a crucial role in shaping economic performance, governance effectiveness, and public welfare (Emynorane et al., 2024). Ideally, regulations should create a predictable legal environment that supports business development, protects consumers and the environment, and fosters fair competition. However, in many developing nations, regulatory systems are often weak, inconsistent, or excessively burdensome (Evensen & Sovacool, 2024). This can result from outdated laws, overlapping mandates among government agencies, or a lack of consultation with stakeholders during policy formulation. Poor regulatory quality often discourages investment, limits entrepreneurship, and drives many firms into the informal sector where regulations are easily evaded.

One of the main challenges facing regulatory systems in developing countries is institutional weakness and corruption (Malik., 2024). In many cases, regulations are poorly enforced or selectively applied, depending on political or personal interests. Regulatory agencies may lack the resources, independence, or technical capacity to monitor compliance effectively (Augustin & Emynorane, 2024). This opens the door to bribery, favoritism, and opaque decision-making, which undermines public trust in government. As a result, even well-intentioned policies can become tools for rent-seeking rather than mechanisms for improving public service delivery or economic efficiency.

### Journal of Governance and Public Administration (JoGaPA) Volume 2, No 3 – Juni 2025

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



To improve regulatory quality, developing countries must focus on transparency, accountability, and capacity building (Modipa, 2023). Simplifying business regulations, reducing red tape, and making rules more accessible through digital platforms can help lower barriers to formal economic activity. At the same time, governments must strengthen institutions that oversee regulation, ensure that rules are applied consistently, and involve civil society and the private sector in policymaking processes (Mansourian et al., 2016). By enhancing the design and implementation of regulations, countries can promote inclusive growth, strengthen the rule of law, and build stronger foundations for long-term development.

#### Rule of Law

The Rule of Law refers to the principle that all individuals, institutions, and the government themselves are accountable under laws that are fairly applied and enforced (Esmati et al., 2024). It is a cornerstone of good governance, ensuring that justice is accessible, laws are predictable, and no one is above the law (Francken et al., 2009). In developing countries, however, upholding the rule of law remains a significant challenge due to weak legal institutions, corruption, political interference, and limited access to justice, especially for poor and marginalized communities.

In many developing nations, judicial systems are under-resourced and often lack independence. Courts may face delays in case processing, a shortage of qualified judges, and susceptibility to political pressure. As a result, legal decisions may not be impartial or timely, undermining public trust in the justice system (Kaufmann et al., 2010). Corruption further weakens the rule of law, with law enforcement and judicial officials sometimes accepting bribes or favoring powerful individuals (Augustin & Emynorane, 2024). When laws are not enforced equally, or legal remedies are only available to the wealthy and well-connected, citizens lose confidence in the fairness and credibility of public institutions (Mutarindwa et al., 2020).

Another major issue is limited access to legal services and legal awareness. In rural or underserved areas, people often do not know their legal rights or how to seek justice. Legal aid services are either unavailable or underdeveloped, making it difficult for the poor to resolve disputes or defend themselves against exploitation (Long et al., 2021). Women, minorities, and other vulnerable groups are particularly at risk of legal exclusion. Strengthening the rule of law in developing countries thus requires not only institutional reform but also efforts to improve legal literacy, expand legal aid, and ensure laws are applied without discrimination (Emynorane & Arrive, 2024).

To advance the rule of law, developing countries need to invest in judicial reform, legal training, anti-corruption efforts, and community-based legal empowerment (Klein et al., 2023; Emynorane et al., 2024; Lutterbeck, 2013). Ensuring that the legal framework protects human rights, property rights, and contractual obligations is key to both social stability and economic development. International partnerships and donor support can also play a role by providing technical assistance and promoting the best practices. Ultimately, a strong rule of law creates a foundation for accountable governance, peaceful conflict resolution, and sustainable development (Sima et al., 2023).

### **Control of Corruption**

Controlling corruption is one of the most pressing governance challenges facing developing countries (Emynorane & Arrive, 2024). Corruption undermines the

**Volume 2, No 3 - Juni 2025** 

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



legitimacy of government institutions, distorts public spending, weakens service delivery, and erodes public trust. In many developing nations, corruption takes various forms ranging from petty bribery in everyday services to large-scale embezzlement, political patronage, and illicit enrichment by public officials (Long et al., 2021). These practices not only waste resources but also discourage foreign investment, deepen inequality, and limit the effectiveness of anti-poverty programs.

Governments in developing countries have adopted a range of strategies to control corruption, with mixed results (Mansourian et al., 2016). Many have established anti-corruption commissions or agencies, introduced public financial management reforms, and enacted transparency and accountability laws (Lutterbeck, 2013). Some countries have embraced e-governance tools to reduce direct interactions between citizens and officials such as digital tax filing or online business registration helping to cut down opportunities for bribery (Emynorane et al., 2024). Whistleblower protection laws and open data initiatives are also used to encourage citizen oversight and media scrutiny of public officials.

Despite these efforts, success is often hindered by weak institutions, lack of political will, and entrenched interests. Anti-corruption agencies may lack independence, funding, or enforcement power (Klein et al., 2023). In some cases, such institutions are used more for political vendettas than for genuine reform (Esmati et al., 2024). Moreover, when top-level officials or political elites are involved in corruption, investigations are often blocked or ignored. Public procurement and contracting areas especially vulnerable to corruption remain opaque in many countries, with limited oversight or citizen participation (Long et al., 2021).

To be effective, anti-corruption efforts must go beyond symbolic reforms and target systemic weaknesses (Evensen & Sovacool, 2024). Strengthening judicial independence, enforcing conflict-of-interest laws, and ensuring transparency in budgeting and procurement processes are essential. Civic engagement is also crucial to empowering media, civil society, and watchdog organizations to hold officials accountable. International cooperation, such as tracking illicit financial flows and enforcing anti-money laundering standards, can complement domestic efforts (Goel et al., 2017). Ultimately, controlling corruption in developing countries requires consistent leadership, a culture of accountability, and an empowered, informed citizenry.

### **CONCLUSION**

This study has explored the core dimensions of governance in developing countries through a qualitative analysis of secondary sources, revealing persistent challenges such as weak institutions, limited citizen participation, poor service delivery, inconsistent regulatory practices, and widespread corruption. These issues are deeply interconnected, often reinforcing one another and undermining public trust and development outcomes. Despite these obstacles, the study identified promising practices including digital governance tools, participatory budgeting, and transparency initiatives that demonstrate the potential for meaningful reform when supported by political commitment and adapted to local contexts. To strengthen governance, it is essential for developing countries to invest in institutional capacity, promote transparency, encourage inclusive public participation, leverage digital technologies, and engage in regional and international cooperation. Ongoing political commitment and active citizen participation are essential for establishing accountable, effective, and resilient governance systems that can drive and sustain long-term development.

**Volume 2, No 3 - Juni 2025** 

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



#### REFERENCE

- Alizadeh, A., & Hashemi, S. (2022). Revisiting Governance Indicators: A Multidimensional Approach for Developing Countries. *Journal of Development Studies*, 58(4), 615–630. https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2022.2034045
- Apaza, C. R. (2009). Measuring Governance and Corruption through the Worldwide Governance Indicators: Critiques, Responses, and Ongoing Scholarly Discussion. *PS: Political Science and Politics*, 42(1), 139–143. http://www.jstor.org/stable/20452388
- Arrive, J. T., Emynorane, R. H., & Fidelys, L. N. (2024). Chinese Corporate Culture on Performance of Economic Growth. *International Journal of Innovative Science and Research Technology*, 9(5), 2875-2885. https://doi.org/10.38124/ijisrt/IJISRT24MAY2303
- Augustin, R. S., & Emynorane, R. H. (2024). Intercultural Approach in Teaching Indonesian Language to Madagascar Students: Comparative Study between Elementary School and University Learners. *Jurnal Ilmiah Widya Pustaka Pendidikan*, 12(2), 59 69. Retrieved from https://jiwpp.unram.ac.id/index.php/widya/article/view/258
- Brudney, J. L., Cheng, Y., & Meijs, L. (2022). Defining and Measuring Coproduction:
  Deriving Lessons from Practicing Local Government Managers. *Public Administration Review*, 82(5), 795-805. https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.13476
- Emynorane, R. H, Arrive, J. T., Tsitaitse, T. J., Marcel, F., & Bien-Aimé, W. D. (2025). Drivers' Experiences of Traffic Police Corruption and the Implications for Governance Reform: Case Study of Madagascar's National Police and Gendarmerie. *Jurnal Pemerintahan Dan Politik*, 10(2), 344–355. https://doi.org/10.36982/jpp.v10i2.5164
- Emynorane, R. H., & Arrive, J. T. (2024). Characteristics of African Political Leaders: Perspectives of African International Students. *Journal of Governance and Public Administration (JoGaPA*), 2 (1). https://doi.org/10.70248/jogapa.v2i1.1647
- Emynorane, R. H., Ratna, H. E., Citriadin, Y., Arrive J. T., & Larissa, R. (2024). Conflict Management between Teachers and Students: Case of Esperanto Private High School in Madagascar. *Jurnal Pendidikan: Teori dan Praktik*, 9(2) 165-174. Doi.org/10.26740/jp.v9n2.p165-174
- Esmati, S., Emynorane, R. H., & Arrive, J. T. (2024). The Neoliberal Political Economy of Higher Education: Marketization and Its Impact on Access and Quality at Universitas Hasanuddin. *Journal of Governance and Public Administration (JoGaPA)*, 2 (1). https://doi.org/10.70248/jogapa.v2i1.1688
- Evensen, D., & Sovacool, B. K. (2024). Political economy of low-carbon electricity: Governance effects across 198 countries. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 189. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2023.114016
- Francken, N., Minten, B., & Swinnen, J. F. M. (2009). Media, Monitoring, and Capture of Public Funds: Evidence from Madagascar. World Development, 37(1), 242–255. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2008.01.005
- Goel, R. K., Mazhar, U., Nelson, M. A., & Ram, R. (2017). Different forms of Decentralization and their Impact on Government Performance: Micro-level evidence from 113 countries. *Economic Modelling*, 62, 171–183. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econmod.2016.12.010
- Kaufmann, D., Kraay, A., & Mastruzzi, M. (2010). The Worldwide Governance Indicators:

**Volume 2, No 3 – Juni 2025** 

e-ISSN: 3031-7584



- Methodology and Analytical Issues. *Policy Research Working Paper*, 5430, 1 28.
- Klein, B., Mullard, S., Ahamadi, K., Mara, P., Mena, J., Nourdine, S., Rakoto, M., Tombozandry, D., & Maraina, A. V. (2023). (Re)Interpreting Corruption in Local Environments: Disputed definitions, contested conservation, and power plays in Northern Madagascar. *Political Geography*, 107. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2023.102973
- Long, S., Thurlow, G., Jones, P. J. S., Turner, A., Randrianantenaina, S. M., Gammage, T., Savage, J., & Ndriamanja, J. R. (2021). Critical analysis of the governance of the Sainte Luce Locally Managed Marine Area (LMMA), southeast Madagascar. *Marine Policy*, 127. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2019.103691
- Lutterbeck, D. (2013). *The paradox of Gendarmeries: between expansion, demilitarization and dissolution*. DCAF.
- Malik, I. (2024). Government Effectiveness and Good Governance Index: The Case of Indonesia. *Journal of Governance*, 9(1), 106–126. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.31506/jog.v9i1.23787
- Mansourian, S., Razafimahatratra, A., Ranjatson, P., & Rambeloarisao, G. (2016). Novel Governance for Forest Landscape Restoration in Fandriana Marolambo, Madagascar. *World Development Perspectives*, 3, 28–31. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wdp.2016.11.009
- Modipa, M. (2023). Road Traffic Accidents in South Africa: Challenges and Solutions. *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science* (2147- 4478), 12(8), 557–565. https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v12i8.2940
- Mutarindwa, S., Schäfer, D., & Stephan, A. (2020). Central Banks' Supervisory Guidance on Corporate Governance and Bank Stability: Evidence from African countries. *Emerging Markets Review*, 43. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ememar.2020.100694
- Rahman, K., Kelso, C., & Jenkins, M. (2019). *Transparency International Overview of corruption and anti-corruption in Madagascar: Focus on the natural resource sector and gold.* In Transparency International.
- Rondinelli, D. A. (1981). Government Decentralization in Comparative Perspective: Theory and Practice in Developing Countries. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 47(2), 133-145. https://doi.org/10.1177/002085238004700205
- Sima, M., Liang, P., & Qingjie, Z. (2023). The Impact of Fiscal Decentralization on Economic Growth: A comparative Analysis of Selected African and OECD Countries. *Heliyon*, 9(9). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e19520
- Smith, S. M., Shepherd, D. D., & Dorward, P. T. (2012). Perspectives on Community Representation within the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative: Experiences from South-East Madagascar. *Resources Policy*, 37(2), 241–250. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2011.01.001
- Thamrin, N., Wulansari, I. Y., & Irawan, P. B. (2023). Measuring the Performance of SDGS in Provincial level using Regional Sustainable Development Index. *Journal of Environmental Science and Sustainable Development*, 6(2), 294-314. https://doi.org/10.7454/jessd.v6i2.1176